

# **Jurnal Pendidikan dan Konseling**

Volume 4 Nomor 5 Tahun 2022 <u>E-ISSN: 2685-936X</u> dan <u>P-ISSN: 2685-9351</u> **Universitas Pahlawan Tuanku Tambusai** 



# **Quality Management Concept in Higher Education**

### **Tukiran**

Institut Teknologi Sumatera (ITERA), Lampung, Indonesia Email: <a href="mailto:tukiran@sll.itera.ac.id">tukiran@sll.itera.ac.id</a>

#### Abstract

Quality education is a necessity in the implementation of higher education and as one of the determinants for the development of the country. Quality graduates need a quality education system as well. In establishing a quality education system, in addition to human resources, facilities and infrastructure, curriculum and capital, quality management is also required. There are four areas of successful higher education management, such as: (1) students are satisfied with higher education services; (2) educational customers are satisfied with the service to their students; (3) shareholders are satisfied to have high-quality graduates who meet expectations; (4) lecturers and staff are satisfied with higher education services in several areas: division of labor, relations and communication between lecturers/leaders, employees, salary/honorarium received and services **Keywords**: *Management*, *Quality*, *Higher Education*.

### **INTRODUCTION**

Quality education is a necessity in the implementation of higher education and as one of the determinants for the development of the country. Quality graduates need a quality education system as well. In establishing a quality education system, in addition to human resources, facilities and infrastructure, curriculum and capital, quality management is also needed.(Sila 2017)

Quality improvement is one of the prerequisites so that humans can enter the era of globalization which is full of healthy and quality competition. Where the existence of Higher Education as an educational institution will not be separated from the global competition. For this reason, quality improvement is the main agenda in improving the quality of higher education in order to survive in the global era. Integrated Quality Management is an integrated quality improvement concept in the field of management. Factors that cause the low quality of higher education are due to the lack of optimal management of higher education, limited facilities and learning support facilities, and there are still human resources for lecturers who have not mastered or have not met the requirements. The author assumes that the "mainstream" is the management aspect of higher education itself. Departing from this assumption, the author then hypothesizes that improving management can improve the quality of education in Indonesia, especially in higher education.

Quality of education is a key factor for improving business quality, and therefore strengthening competitive advantage. (Hadi 2018) Quality is defined as standards and excellence, so that the main element of quality in quality management is understood as the process of ensuring that there are specific standards and are continuously being pursued for a superior product or service. Thus, if quality is applied in learning, it refers to the high and low of learning compared to the standard. (Basyar 2016) To ensure the quality and quality of education, serious attention is needed, both by education providers, the government, and the community. Because in the current national education system, concentration on quality and quality is not solely the responsibility of Higher Education and the government, but is a synergy between various components, including the community.

To carry out the quality assurance, systematic and planned activities are needed in the form of quality management. Quality management in education is a way of managing all educational resources, which are directed so that all people involved in it carry out their duties with enthusiasm and participate in improving the

implementation of work so as to produce services that match and even exceed the expectations of "customers of education".

With the paradigm of government policy along with the development of science and technology that has brought changes in almost all aspects of human life where various problems can be solved by efforts to master and improve science and technology which is very beneficial for human life, but on the one hand these changes also has brought humans into an era of increasingly fierce global competition. In order to be able to play a role in global competition, as a nation we need to continue to develop and improve the quality of its human resources. Improving the quality of human resources is a necessity that must be carried out in a "planned, directed, intensive, effective, efficient, and productive" way in the development process. The urgency of improving the quality of human resources has made the government and the private sector jointly and continuously strive to make it happen through various efforts to develop higher quality education.

### **METHOD**

This type of research is library research, namely research that focuses on research using data (Kartini, 1996) which is then followed by writing, editing, clarifying, reducing and presenting. ( Noeng Muhajir, 2002) According to Noeng Muhadjir, library research requires more philosophical and theoretical preparation than empirical testing in the field. (Noeng Mujadjir, 1996)

### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### MANAGEMENT POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION

- G. R. Terry defines management as "the accomplishing of the predetermined, objective through the efforts of other people." Management is achieving predetermined goals (organizational) by using the help of others. (Fadhillah 2016) Policies are always associated with the public (Wikipedia Indonesian). Public Policy (UK: Public Policy) are decisions that are binding on the people at a strategic level or are broad in nature made by public authorities. Meanwhile, according to Nurcholis policy as a decision of an organization that is intended to achieve certain goals, contains provisions that can be used as behavioral guidelines in terms of:
- 1. Further decision making must be carried out by either the target group or the organizational (unit) of implementing the policy.
- 2. The implementation or implementation of a policy that has been determined both in relation to the implementing organization (unit) and with the intended target group.

Policies can be in the form of decisions that are thought out carefully and carefully by top decision makers rather than routine and programmed repetitive activities or related to decision rules..

### **MANAGEMENT**

Management is the science and art of managing the process of utilizing human resources and other resources effectively and efficiently to achieve certain goals.(Kuntoro 2019) According to Syafaruddin, management is a process of regulating and utilizing organizational resources through the cooperation of members to achieve organizational goals effectively and efficiently. In general, management functions are divided into 4 types, namely:

# 1. Planning (Planning)

Planning is the process of setting goals and vision of the organization as the first step in the establishment of an organization. The planning function is identical to the preparation of strategies, standards, and directions and goals in achieving organizational goals.

# 2. Organizing

Organizing relates to how to organize both human and physical resources so that they are arranged systematically based on their respective functions. In other words, this organizing function emphasizes more on how to group people and resources together.

# 3. Directing

The management function in terms of direction puts more emphasis on efforts to increase the effectiveness and efficiency of optimal performance. Starting from providing work guidance, motivation, explanation of routine tasks, and so on.

### 4. Controlling Function

The control function is more focused on evaluating and assessing the performance that has been carried out and running. The control function will see whether there is an obstacle or not in the process of achieving organizational goals.

Therefore, to achieve organizational goals, optimal performance improvement is needed.

#### **LECTURER PERFORMANCE**

Lecturer performance is the outcome of the process carried out by lecturers through work presentations, work implementation, work achievements, work results and performance. Performance is also something that can be measured through evaluation or performance appraisal. (Nadeak, n.d.) Performance is the result of real work (outcomes of work) of each person for work performance in accordance with his role in the company (organization) (Rivai V Zainal dan Sagala, 2009; Mahmudi, 2007).(Simanjuntak and Wahyanti 2021)

Performance is the result obtained by an organization whether the organization is profit oriented and non profit oriented which is produced over a period of time. According to Indra Bastian, performance is a description of the level of achievement of the implementation of an activity/program/policy in realizing the goals, objectives, mission and vision of the organization as stated in the formulation of the strategic plan (strategic planning) of an organization. Based on this opinion, performance can be classified into two, namely concrete and abstract: (1) Concrete performance is the result of work that can be easily and directly seen, proven and measured. (2) Abstract performance is the result of work that cannot be seen and requires a complicated process to measure it, such as responsibility, loyalty and others. Meanwhile, according to Nanang Fattah suggests that: work performance (Performance) is an expression of ability based on knowledge, attitudes and skills as well as motivation in producing a job.

Thus, the position of a lecturer as a profession requires special expertise and skills in the field of education and teaching. So, the lecturer is an educator, so the existence of the lecturer is not only the obligation to convey material (transfer of knowledge) to students, but also the obligation of skills and values (transfer of skills and transfer of value). This means that the lecturer's task is not finished in the knowledge aspect alone, is good at science and can convey to students, but also must be able to be an example for his students, the behavior carried out by the lecturer must be a mirror or example for his students.

# **FACTORS AFFECTING PERFORMANCE**

### 1. Effectiveness and efficiency

When a certain goal can finally be achieved. We may say that the activity is effective, but the consequences that are not sought are the important assessment activities of the results achieved so as to result in satisfaction even though they are effective are called inefficient. On the other hand, if the desired result is not important or trivial, then the activity is efficient.

## 2. Authority (Authority)

Authority is a communication or order in a formal organization that is owned by a member of the organization to other members to carry out a work activity in accordance with his contribution.

# 3. Discipline

Discipline is obeying applicable laws and regulations. So, employee discipline is the activity of the employee concerned in respecting the work agreement with the organization where he works.

## 4. Initiative

Initiative, which is related to the power of thought and creativity in forming ideas to plan something related to organizational goals.

# **EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE CHARACTERISTICS**

The characteristics of people who have high performance are as follows:

- 1. Have a high personal responsibility.
- 2. Dare to take and bear the risks faced.
- 3. Have realistic goals.
- 4. Have a comprehensive work plan and strive to realize its goals.

- 5. Utilizing concrete feedback in all work activities he does.
- 6. Looking for opportunities to realize the plans that have been programmed.

In addition, having high human resources and high work motivation are also characteristics of high performance.

#### **EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE INDICATORS**

Meanwhile, Berk (1986) explains how to conduct performance appraisals, namely the process of collecting data by means of systematic observations to make decisions about individuals. There are five main aspects that are implied and stated in the definition, namely: process, data collection, systematic observation, data integration, and individual decisions..(Retnowati, Mardapi, and Kartowagiran 2018) There are six indicators to measure employee performance individually, namely:

- 1. Quality. The quality of work is measured by the employee's perception of the quality of the work produced and the perfection of the task on the skills and abilities of employees.
- 2. Quantity. Represents the resulting amount expressed in terms such as number of units, number of completed activity cycles.
- 3. Punctuality. It is the level of activity completed at the beginning of the stated time, from the point of view of coordinating with the output results and maximizing the time available for other activities.
- 4. Effectiveness. Is the level of use of organizational resources (manpower, money, technology, raw materials) is maximized with the intention of increasing the results of each unit in the use of resources.
- 5. Independence. This is the level of an employee who will be able to carry out his work functions and work commitments. Is a level where employees have a commitment to work with the agency and employee responsibilities to the office.

# PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT FUNCTION

To assess the performance Mitchell (1987) states that the aspects seen in assessing individual performance are: "quality of work, proptness, initiative, capability, and communication".(Razak, Syah, and Aziz 2017) According to Handoko, the functions of holding performance appraisals in every organization are as follows:

- 1. As a basis for determining payroll decisions.
- 2. As a basis for feedback on the performance of a person or group.
- 3. Identify the strengths and weaknesses of the assessed employees.
- 4. As a basis for consideration for promotion decisions.
- 5. As a basis for consideration for transfer and dismissal decisions.
- 6. As a basis for consideration for training and development decisions.
- 7. As a basis for consideration for award decisions (reward).
- 8. As a tool to motivate and improve performance.

# PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENT BENEFITS

One of the quality of education in higher education can be seen from the quality of lecturers' performance in carrying out their duties. (Nurkhaerani, Wijayanto, and Syah 2013) A lecturer can be said to be professional if he has high human resources, high ability (high level of abstract) and high work motivation (high level of commitment). Lecturers who have low human resources, low commitment, usually pay less attention to students. Likewise, the time and energy spent to improve the quality of learning is also very little. "On the other hand, a lecturer who has high human resources and high commitment is usually very motivated to work, so the time provided for improving the quality of education is very much".

Factors that affect the performance of lecturers include: high human resources, knowledge, skills, skills, attitudes and behavior of employees. The benefits of measuring performance based on the performance accountability module of government agencies, state administration institutions (are: (1) Ensuring understanding of the implementation and the measures used to achieve performance. (2) Ensuring the

achievement of the agreed work plan. (3) Monitoring and evaluating work implementation and take performance improvement actions (4) Provide objective rewards and punishments for their implementation achievements that have been measured in accordance with the agreed performance measurement system (5) Identify whether customer satisfaction has been met (6) Help understand the process of government agency activities. (7) Ensuring that decision making is carried out objectively (8) Indicating improvements that need to be made (9) Revealing existing problems Meanwhile, according to Irham Fahmi, the function of performance management is to try to provide enlightenment and answers to various problems that occur in an organization ok y caused by internal and external factors, so that what is experienced at this time does not have a negative influence on the company's current and future activities. Thus, performance appraisal is a review or evaluation that refers to a systematic overview and review of one's job performance. In addition, providing feedback to the lecturer with the aim of motivating the lecturer to eliminate the decline in performance or continue to work higher so that there is an increase in lecturer performance.

### **DEFINITION OF QUALITY**

According to Crosby (1979:58), quality is conformance to requirements, which is in accordance with what is required or standardized.(Rifa'i 2019) Quality is the degree of excellence of a product or work, either in the form of goods or services. There are many definitions of quality. In the Big Indonesian Dictionary, quality is (a measure of) the good or bad of an object, its level, level, degree, or quality (intelligence, intelligence, etc.). Meanwhile, other notions of quality are put forward by experts from different perspectives. Among them, Edward Deming, said that quality is: "A predictive degree of uniformity and dependability at a low cost, suitable to the market". Another opinion, as stated by Joseph M. Juran, quality is: "Fitness for use, as judged by the user". Then Philip B. Crossby, said "Conformance to requirements" and Armand V. Feigenbaum, said "Full customer satisfaction".

In essence, some of the meanings of quality are the same and have the following elements: first, it includes efforts to meet or exceed customer expectations. Second, includes products, services, people, processes and the environment. Third, is a condition that is always changing. Based on these elements, quality can be defined as a dynamic condition associated with products, services, people, processes and the environment that meet and even exceed expectations.

Meanwhile, if viewed from the side of education, the quality of education can be defined as the ability of higher education in operational and efficient management of components related to higher education, so as to produce added value to these components according to applicable norms/standards. The quality of education also implies the degree of excellence in managing education effectively and efficiently to give birth to academic excellence in students who are declared to have passed for one level of education or completed a certain learning program.

From the several notions of quality above, the authors can conclude that in general, quality is the overall characteristics or characteristics of a product or service in its aim to meet the needs and expectations of "educational customers". If the word quality is combined with the word education, it means referring to the quality of the product produced by educational institutions or higher education, which can be identified from the number of students who have achievements, both academic achievements and non-academic achievements, and the graduates are relevant to the objectives.

In general, it can be said that the quality of the product or service will be realized if the orientation of all the organization's activities is oriented to customer satisfaction. Meanwhile, according to Djam'an Satori, quality assurance is a thought based on the need for protection for those who use products or services. Consumers should not be harmed by getting goods that are defective, quickly damaged, or uncomfortable to use. Education quality assurance is an effort to provide learning services in such a way, so that consumers (students) can develop their potential optimally.

From some of the definitions of quality above, the writer can conclude that in general, quality is the overall characteristics or characteristics of products or services in order to meet customer needs and expectations.

### **QUALITY MANAGEMENT STEPS**

The characteristics of quality management (as a form of customer service), as desired in TQM are:

### 1. Timeliness of service

Every time you do it, of course, there is a set target time. In achieving the goals formulated, of course, must be right in accordance with the specified time.

#### 2. Service Accuracy

In achieving the quality of education, of course there is accuracy in his work to achieve these goals, so that his work has good quality.

# 3. Courtesy and hospitality

In maintaining consumer interest and trust, education stakeholders strive to provide hospitality in providing services so that consumers will always believe in the quality or quality of education.

4. Responsible for all customer complaints.

The responsibility for all customer complaints, namely the community and others is the responsibility of stakeholders in education. Complaints as input and motivation for Higher Education in improving the quality or quality of education.

### 5. Completeness of service

The completeness of this service will improve the quality or quality of education. Adequate and complete infrastructure facilities will attract the attention of consumers, and also with complete infrastructure facilities will certainly be able to improve the quality of education.

# 6. Ease of getting service

Education that provides convenience in the community will provide an attraction to the community. The services provided to Higher Education for students or the community will provide an assessment of consumers or quality in Higher Education.

#### 7. Service Variations

The provision of this service in providing services of course there are varied steps so that the quality of education can be achieved. These variations of steps are needed when the steps taken are less successful.

# 8. Personal Service

This personal service is a personal service for each Higher Education personnel.

# 9. Convenience

Creating a comfortable atmosphere among personnel in educational institutions must be maintained. Because with this comfort it will provide harmony in relation to personnel in Higher Education so that activities in Higher Education can run well.

# 10. Availability of supporting attributes

Creating a comfortable atmosphere between personnel in educational institutions must be maintained, because with this comfort it will provide harmony in their relationship with personnel in Higher Education so that activities in Higher Education can run well.

# **EDUCATION QUALITY IMPROVEMENT MANAGEMENT**

Higher education as a formal educational institution, in the implementation of education, it is very necessary to improve the quality of the quality. Education can be said to be of high quality and quality if all its aspects meet the standards. Management can be used as a tool or a way to achieve quality improvement with one of the pillars is human resources.(Primayana 2015)

There are three factors that cause the low quality of education, namely: 1) National education policies and administration use the educational production function or inconsistent analytical inputs; 2) Implementation is carried out in a centralized manner; 3) The participation of the community, especially parents, in the implementation of education is very minimal.

To realize the above policy, Higher Education needs to carry out quality improvement management. Quality Improvement Management hereinafter abbreviated as MPM is a model developed in the world of education, as has been running in Sedney, Australia which includes: Quality Assurance and Quality Control, combined with the model developed in Pittsbrurg, United States by Donald Adams, et al. All programs to improve the quality of higher education will not run effectively and efficiently without the support of adequate funds, whether they come from the government, the community, or the business world.

From the explanation above, it can be concluded that quality management is a way of managing an organization that is comprehensive and integrated which is directed at meeting customer needs consistently and achieving continuous improvement in every aspect of the organization's activities. The aim of quality management is to improve the quality of work, improve productivity and efficiency through performance improvement and work quality improvement in order to produce products that satisfy or meet customer needs. In production management, there is a guarantee mechanism so that the products produced can meet quality standards. For this reason, quality control must be carried out from the beginning of planning. If quality control is carried out after the product is produced, it can face the risk of a number of products that are not in accordance with the expected standards. In such a paradigm, the main purpose of quality management is to prevent and reduce the risk of errors in the production process, by ensuring that every step carried out during the production process can run as well as possible according to standards. Thus, quality management is not just trying to make the products produced meet quality standards, but more focused on how the production process can be carried out properly, in accordance with the procedures that should be carried out.

With a good production process, of course it will be able to produce good products as well. Quality and quality education is the hope and dream of every citizen. Society, whether organized in an educational institution, really hopes that students and their children get a quality education so that they can compete in life in the future. To answer the expectations of the community, every higher education should always strive so that the education it manages can produce quality products, namely products that can satisfy customers. The practice of providing education can be compared to the production process in a company (industry).20 However, the products produced by educational institutions are in the form of services. Therefore, educational institutions can be said to be service companies.

From this perspective, the quality and quality of services (services) produced is a measure of the quality of a higher education, namely the extent to which customer satisfaction with the services produced. For that in a university can be said to be of quality if it has met the standards, the main mission of an institution is to meet the needs and desires of its customers. to customers in accordance with certain quality standards, not only in terms of the quality of graduates. Quality education can not only be seen from the quality of its graduates, but also includes how higher education is able to meet and serve customer needs in accordance with applicable quality standards.

The customers here are internal customers, lecturers and other employees, and external customers, namely students and related parties outside the higher education. Thus, higher education is said to be of high quality if it is able to provide services that match or even exceed the expectations of lecturers, employees, students and other related parties such as funders, the government or the world of work using graduates.

To provide assurance of quality and quality, higher education must know exactly what is needed by its customers. Higher education should always strive to synergize various components to carry out quality management of the education it manages in order to carry out educational duties and functions. For this reason, cooperation with all components of higher education in management must be a priority. The components of higher education in question are lecturers, employees, students and the community. Cooperation with the higher education component is intended to involve and empower them

# THE IMPORTANCE OF QUALITY MANAGEMENT IN EDUCATION

Regional autonomy has an impact on the management of education in the regions. With the implementation of educational autonomy, it is hoped that it will have a positive effect on the growth of quality educational institutions. Every educational institution is expected to be able to explore regional resources and potentials based on local excellence. The unavoidable consequence of the decentralization of education, due to the very diverse culture and potential of the region, is the variety of graduates. Therefore, efforts to standardize quality and ensure that the implementation of education meets quality standards must be the focus of attention in efforts to maintain and improve the quality of education nationally.

To ensure the implementation of education in accordance with quality standards, it is necessary to continuously and continuously assess the feasibility and performance carried out in the context of making improvements and improving the quality of higher education. According to Mohammad Ali, the assessment of the feasibility and performance on an ongoing basis cannot be separated from management, especially the

quality management of higher education, which has the main objective of preventing and reducing the risk of errors in the production process, by ensuring that every step carried out during the production process is carried out. production can run as well as possible according to standards.

From the explanation above, it can be understood that to ensure the implementation of quality standardization and education quality, quality management has an important role. This is because activities in quality management are not just trying to make the products produced meet quality standards, but are more focused on how the production process can be carried out properly, in accordance with the procedures that should be carried out in order to produce products that satisfy customers, especially people who use educational services.

### **CONCLUSION**

A policy is always associated with the public. Public policies are decisions that are binding on many people at the strategic or outline level made by public authorities. Performance is an activity that has been achieved by a worker in carrying out the tasks and work assigned to him. The success of quality management in higher education can be measured by the level of customer satisfaction. Higher education can be said to be successful if it is able to provide services according to the expectations of "customers of education" and produce satisfying products, especially the community who use education services

#### **REFERENCES**

- Basyar, Syaripudin. 2016. "Manajemen Mutu Pendidikan Perguruan Tinggi Keagamaan Islam Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Mahasiswa." Jurnal Dewantara 1 (01): 1–15.
- Fadhillah, Kharis. 2016. "Manajemen Mutu Pendidikan Islam Di Pesantren (Studi Di Pondok Modern Darussalam Gontor)." At-Ta'dib 10 (1). https://doi.org/10.21111/at-tadib.v10i1.333.
- Hadi, Abdul. 2018. "Konsepsi Manajemen Mutu Dalam Pendidikan." MODELING: Jurnal Program Studi PGMI 5 (2): 134–44.
- Kuntoro, Alfian Tri. 2019. "Manajemen Mutu Pendidikan Islam." Jurnal Kependidikan 7 (1): 84–97. https://doi.org/10.24090/jk.v7i1.2928.
- Nadeak, Bernadetha. n.d. "DESKRIPSI KINERJA DOSEN PERGURUAN TINGGI SWASTA DI INDONESIA," 108.
- Nurkhaerani, Rizky, Hari Wijayanto, and Dahrul Syah. 2013. "EKSPLORASI KINERJA DOSEN TERSERTIFIKASI DALAM MELAKSANAKAN TRIDHARMA PERGURUAN TINGGI DI INDONESIA." Xplore: Journal of Statistics 1 (2). https://doi.org/10.29244/xplore.v1i2.12410.
- Primayana, Kadek Hengki. 2015. "Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Dalam Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Perguruan Tinggi." Jurnal Penjaminan Mutu 1 (02): 7–15. https://doi.org/10.25078/jpm.v1i02.1365.
- Razak, Yusran, Darwyan Syah, and Abd Aziz. 2017. "KEPEMIMPINAN, KINERJA DOSEN DALAM PENINGKATAN MUTU PENDIDIKAN PERGURUAN TINGGI." Tanzhim 1 (02): 30–44.
- Retnowati, Trie Hartiti, Djemari Mardapi, and Badrun Kartowagiran. 2018. "Kinerja dosen di bidang penelitian dan publikasi ilmiah." Jurnal Akuntabilitas Manajemen Pendidikan 6 (2): 215–25. https://doi.org/10.21831/amp.v6i2.21524.
- Rifa'i, Andi Arif. 2019. "Sistem Penjaminan Mutu Pendidikan Tinggi Di Indonesia." Edugama: Jurnal Kependidikan Dan Sosial Keagamaan 5 (1): 155–75. https://doi.org/10.32923/edugama.v5i1.963.
- Sila, I. Made. 2017. "PERANAN MANAJEMEN MUTU PENDIDIKAN TINGGI BERBASIS SPMI DALAM MENINGKATKAN PELAYANAN UNTUK MEWUJUDKAN PENDIDIKAN BERKUALITAS." Widya Accarya 8 (2). https://doi.org/10.46650/wa.8.2.506.%p.
- Simanjuntak, Sean Togar, and Caecilia Tri Wahyanti. 2021. "Analisis Kinerja Dosen Melaksanakan Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19: Studi Kasus Di Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana." JENIUS (Jurnal Ilmiah Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia) 5 (1): 86–101. https://doi.org/10.32493/JJSDM.v5i1.13144.
- Kartini, 1996. "Pengantar Metodologi Riset" Bandung: Mandar Maju, h.33.
- Noeng Muhajir, 2002. Metodologi Penelitian Kualitait", Yogyakarta: Rake Sarasin.,
- Noeng Mujadjir, 1996. "Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif", Edisi Ke-3. Yogyakarta: Rake Sarasin